

The attached viability report has been submitted by the applicant in support of planning application 16/05376/F, relating to the redevelopment of the former Blackberry Hill Hospital Site in Fishponds.

The Council will form its own view of the viability of the scheme and therefore it cannot be assumed that the conclusions contained in the attached viability report will be those that are reported to a future planning committee.

It should also be noted that major development schemes such as this may be amended during the course of assessing the planning application, and that in such cases further viability reports may be required.





Report

St Catherine's Court Berkeley Place Bristol BS8 1BQ

T: +44 (0)8449 02 03 04 F: +44 (0)117 988 5344



Viability report - Blackberry Hill Hospital

CONFIDENTIAL - NOT FOR PUBLIC DISCLOSURE

October 2016

On behalf of Galliford Try PLC, GT Homes (Blackberry Hill) LLP and Homes and Community Agency (HCA)

Contents

1.	Introduction	. 1
2.	Location and description	. 1
3.	Proposed development	. 2
4.	Financial viability	. 3
5.	Viability appraisal and assumptions	. 4
6.	Conclusion	14

Appendices

Appendix I BCIS costs

Appendix II Appraisal - policy compliant

Appendix III Appraisal - no affordable housing

Appendix IV Accommodation schedule

Prepared By: James Petherick

Date: October 2016

For and on behalf of GVA Grimley Limited

1. Introduction

- 1.1 GVA has been instructed by On behalf of Galliford Try PLC, GT Homes (Blackberry Hill) LLP and Homes and Community Agency (HCA) (the applicant) to provide a viability report to support their planning application for the mixed used redevelopment of Blackberry Hill Hospital, Bristol.
- 1.2 This assessment of viability is necessary to illustrate the extent to which the scheme is unviable when a policy compliant level of affordable housing is provided.
- 1.3 This viability report provides a description of the site and proposed scheme. It also contains a summary of the viability appraisals completed by GVA alongside our assumptions. Our conclusion will set out the case to support reduced provision of affordable housing. Copies of our development appraisals are contained within the appendix.
- 1.4 In accordance with the RICS guidance, this viability report is provided on a confidential basis to the Council. We therefore request that the report should not be disclosed to any third parties (other than consultants instructed by the Council to review this report) under the Freedom of Information Act 2000 (sections 41 and 43 (2)) or under the Environment Information Regulations.
- 1.5 Please note this is not, and is not intended to be a formal valuation. This advice is exempt from the current RICS Valuation Standards (Practice Statement 1.2) and as such cannot be regarded or relied upon as a valuation. This advice has not been based on full research of the asset(s). It provides either a guide for feasibility purposes should the asset be placed on the market, or for any current or impending negotiations on price. We would be happy to undertake a formal valuation as instructed, if required, on the basis of a separate instruction.

2. Location and description

- 2.1 The site was formally the location of a private house, which was later purchased along with its grounds for the development of a prisoner of war camp in the late 18th Century. The oldest buildings on site date back to 1804. The prison closed c. 1814 and was replaced by a military depot, which was substantially converted to a workhouse from the 1830s onwards.
- 2.2 Most of what remains today was part of a rebuilding programme in the 1860s, including the main hospital building which is Grade II listed.
- 2.3 The site covers approximately 8.69 hectares (gross) and its most recent use was a psychiatric hospital. It was purchased by the HCA in March 2009. The net developable acreage is 15.66.

- 2.4 The site comprises a complex of 19th and 20th Century buildings as well as an area of open space covered by a Town and Village Green designation.
- 2.5 The site is bordered by a psychiatric hospital to the north, residential development to the south and a mixture of residential and open space to the east. The site lies in flood zone 1.
- 2.6 The property is relaitively level with a slight fall to the north and west.
- 2.7 Bristol city centre lies approximately 3.9 miles to the south.

3. Proposed development

- 3.1 The proposals put forward by the application are as follows:
 - 'Regeneration, refurbishment and demolition of existing buildings and new build development to provide a total of 305 residential units (comprising of 192 new build and 113 refurbished units) (use class C3), 510 sqm of commercial/retail floorspace (Use class A1/A2/A3/B1) and 280 sq m of community space (Use class D1); new and amended vehicular, pedestrian and cycle access; car parking; cycle parking; landscaping and boundary treatment'
- 3.2 The proposals seek to bring Blackberry Hill back to life as a residential led mixed use scheme. It is proposed that blocks H, J and F (buildings 7, 26 and 37-39) are retained and converted to provide 113 new units including a mixture of apartments, houses and commercial uses. The remainder of the accommodation on site will comprise of new build apartments, houses and commercial units.





4. Financial viability

- 4.1 The RICS 'Financial Viability in Planning' guidance note (August 2012) defines viability as:
 - 'An objective financial viability test of the ability of a development project to meet its costs including the cost of planning obligations, while ensuring an appropriate Site Value for the landowner and a market risk adjusted return to the developer in delivering that project'.
- 4.2 Viability guidance makes clear that the residual value must be above the threshold land value (per hectare/acre) in the local area for the site to be considered viable. If the residual value generated is below this level, and all assumptions used are within market tolerances, then a reduction in statutory contributions can be made to increase site value. A willing seller will not dispose of a site below market value.
- 4.3 This is explained by the National Planning Policy Framework at Paragraph 173:

'To ensure viability, the costs of any requirement likely to be applied to development, ...should, when taking into account the normal cost of development and mitigation, provide competitive returns to a willing land owner and willing developer to enable the development to be deliverable.'

And at paragraph 205:

'Where obligations are being sought or revised, local planning authorities should take account of changes in market conditions over time and, wherever appropriate, be sufficiently flexible to prevent planned development being stalled'

The Blackberry Hill Hospital site is allocated in Bristol's Site Allocations and Development Management Policies DPD (2014) for residential development with mixed uses (Policy SA1, ref. BSA0501). The policy estimates that the site will be able to deliver approximately 300 new homes. Therefore, the principle of residential development on the site with an element of retail/ commercial and community uses is in line with the Council's aspirations for the site and is established.

5. Viability appraisal and assumptions

- 5.1 We have undertaken two appraisals of the subject site. The first, baseline appraisal, considers the policy compliant affordable housing position (30%) and is based on the accommodation schedule as appended to this document. The second appraisal does not feature any affordable housing, in order to test the level at which a viable development proposition is created.
- Our appraisals are targeted towards achieving a residual land value in line with the threshold for the local area when a market level of profit is applied.
- 5.3 We have adopted a full development appraisal of the scheme, residualised against land value using Argus appraisal software. For the avoidance of doubt, costs and revenues are as at today's date and the appraisal assumes planning permission has been granted for the
- Argus Developer is an industry-leading piece of development appraisal software used by developers, agents and financial institutions in order to accurately model development schemes and their tolerances.

Baseline appraisal

- Our baseline appraisal, detailed below, assumes a policy compliant provision of affordable housing and demonstrates the impact on scheme deliverability based on this scenario.
- 5.6 We have detailed our assumptions below in respect of the baseline appraisal. It should be noted that the variant appraisals use the same inputs (save items such as blended profit and marketing fees that move with the amount of affordable housing) in order to create a direct comparison between the differing tenure mixes.

Input	Rate	Total
Revenue		
Open market revenue	199,948 sq ft @ £285.43	£57,072,401
Affordable revenue	83,023 sq ft @ £135	£11,208,105
Ground rent investment	162 units, £250 pa @ 5% yield	£810,000
Commercial investment		£502,187
Gross Development Value		£68,782,692
Costs		
Commercial units	£85 per sq ft	
New build apartments	£114.45 per sq ft	
Conversion	£147.34 per sq ft	£39,385,392
New build housing	£97.91 per sq ft	
Contingency	5% of base build cost	£1,969,270
Demolition		£2,222,572
CIL	£50 per sq m (£4.65 per sq ft) of open market residential (GIA)	£1,068,012
Section 106	Heads of Terms TBA. PC amount	£250,000
External costs	5% of base build cost	£1,932,431
Infrastructure costs	5% of base build cost	£1,932,431
Services	5% of base build cost	£1,932,431
Garages	59 no. @ £6,500 each	£383,500
Professional fees	7% of base build cost	£2,892,248

Marketing costs	Open market - marketing, sales/legal fees - 3% Affordable transfer fee - 1% Commercial investment sale fees - 1.5% Commercial marketing costs - £25,000	£1,856,786
Finance cost	6.5% interest rate inclusive or entry and exit fees	£2,369,284
Profit	20% on market GDV 6% on affordable GDV Blended - 17.7%	£12,174,537
Land value		-1,615,326

Revenue assumptions

- 5.7 We have been supplied with the house types proposed over the entire scheme and have been provided with indicative net sales revenues by the Applicant.
- Net sales figures are the transaction price less any incentives given to the purchaser of a plot. Typically these amount to 5% of the purchase price and include payment of stamp duty, carpets, specification upgrades, part exchange and payment of purchaser's estate agent's fees. It is our experience that house builders prefer providing incentives rather than reducing asking prices.
- 5.9 The table below shows all unit types and their anticipated net sales value:

		Unit	Sales	
Description	Beds	area	revenue	
		sq. ft	per sq. ft	per unit
New Build				
Apartment	1	540	305.56	165,000.00
New Build				
Apartment	1	543	299.26	162,500.00
New Build	1	544	303.31	165,000.00

Apartment	1			
New Build				
Apartment	1	546	302.20	165,000.00
New Build				,
Apartment	1	548	301.09	165,000.00
New Build				
Apartment	1	598	292.64	175,000.00
New Build				
Apartment	2	753	298.80	225,000.00
New Build				
Apartment	2	758	296.83	225,000.00
New Build				
Apartment	2	763	294.89	225,000.00
New Build				
Apartment	2	767	299.87	230,000.00
New Build				
Apartment	2	789	297.85	235,000.00
New Build		020	205.54	245 000 00
Apartment	2	829	295.54	245,000.00
Duplex	3	905	276.24	250,000.00
		9971	297.45	2,965,833.00
	2	760	322.37	245,000.00
	2	788	317.26	250,000.00
	3	905	309.39	280,000.00
	3	915	311.48	285,000.00
	3	1013	301.09	305,000.00
	3	1021	298.73	305,000.00
	3	1080	287.04	310,000.00
	4	1121	312.22	350,000.00
	4			
No. D. Hallis		1156	307.09	355,000.00
New Build House	3	1229	272.58	335,000.00
	4	1277	293.66	375,000.00
	4	1395	265.23	370,000.00
	4	1536	257.16	395,000.00
		14196	293.04	4,160,000.00
	1	435	344.83	150,000.00
	1	435	344.83	150,000.00
	1	435	344.83	150,000.00
	1	443	338.60	150,000.00
	1	453	342.16	155,000.00
	1	464	334.05	155,000.00
	_			
	1	473	332.98	157,500.00
	1	496	322.58	160,000.00
	1	497	321.93	160,000.00
	1	498	321.29	160,000.00
	1	501	319.36	160,000.00

	1	508	324.80	165,000.00
	1	511	325.83	166,500.00
	1	515	320.39	·
	1			165,000.00
	_	525	323.81	170,000.00
	1	548	319.34	175,000.00
	1	552	317.03	175,000.00
	1	556	314.75	175,000.00
	1	558	313.62	175,000.00
	1	560	312.50	175,000.00
	1	565	309.73	175,000.00
	1	605	297.52	180,000.00
	1	673	274.89	185,000.00
	2	692	310.69	215,000.00
	2	722	304.71	220,000.00
	2	736	298.91	220,000.00
	2	744	295.70	220,000.00
	2	769	292.59	225,000.00
	2	777	289.58	225,000.00
	2	804	279.85	225,000.00
	2	807	278.81	225,000.00
	2	812	283.25	230,000.00
	2	820	280.49	230,000.00
	2	836	275.12	230,000.00
Refurb	2	843	272.84	230,000.00
	2	848	271.23	230,000.00
	2	850	270.59	230,000.00
				220,000,00
	2	853	269.64	230,000.00
	2	853 887	269.64 264.94	235,000.00
				1
	2	887	264.94	235,000.00
	2 2	887 926	264.94 259.18	235,000.00 240,000.00
	2 2 2	887 926 929	264.94 259.18 258.34	235,000.00 240,000.00 240,000.00
	2 2 2 2	887 926 929 957	264.94 259.18 258.34 256.01	235,000.00 240,000.00 240,000.00 245,000.00
	2 2 2 2 2	887 926 929 957 981	264.94 259.18 258.34 256.01 249.75	235,000.00 240,000.00 240,000.00 245,000.00 245,000.00
	2 2 2 2 2 2 2	887 926 929 957 981 1003	264.94 259.18 258.34 256.01 249.75 249.25	235,000.00 240,000.00 240,000.00 245,000.00 245,000.00 250,000.00
	2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2	887 926 929 957 981 1003 1006	264.94 259.18 258.34 256.01 249.75 249.25 248.51	235,000.00 240,000.00 240,000.00 245,000.00 245,000.00 250,000.00
	2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2	926 929 957 981 1003 1006 1009	264.94 259.18 258.34 256.01 249.75 249.25 248.51 247.77	235,000.00 240,000.00 240,000.00 245,000.00 245,000.00 250,000.00 250,000.00
	2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2	887 926 929 957 981 1003 1006 1009 1016	264.94 259.18 258.34 256.01 249.75 249.25 248.51 247.77 246.06	235,000.00 240,000.00 240,000.00 245,000.00 245,000.00 250,000.00 250,000.00 250,000.00
	2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2	926 929 957 981 1003 1006 1009 1016	264.94 259.18 258.34 256.01 249.75 249.25 248.51 247.77 246.06 245.58	235,000.00 240,000.00 240,000.00 245,000.00 245,000.00 250,000.00 250,000.00 250,000.00 250,000.00
	2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2	887 926 929 957 981 1003 1006 1009 1016 1018 1037	264.94 259.18 258.34 256.01 249.75 249.25 248.51 247.77 246.06 245.58 245.90	235,000.00 240,000.00 240,000.00 245,000.00 245,000.00 250,000.00 250,000.00 250,000.00 250,000.00 250,000.00
	2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2	887 926 929 957 981 1003 1006 1009 1016 1018 1037 1046	264.94 259.18 258.34 256.01 249.75 249.25 248.51 247.77 246.06 245.58 245.90 243.79	235,000.00 240,000.00 240,000.00 245,000.00 245,000.00 250,000.00 250,000.00 250,000.00 250,000.00 250,000.00 255,000.00 255,000.00
	2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2	887 926 929 957 981 1003 1006 1009 1016 1018 1037 1046 1147	264.94 259.18 258.34 256.01 249.75 249.25 248.51 247.77 246.06 245.58 245.90 243.79 239.76	235,000.00 240,000.00 240,000.00 245,000.00 245,000.00 250,000.00 250,000.00 250,000.00 250,000.00 255,000.00 255,000.00 275,000.00
	2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2	887 926 929 957 981 1003 1006 1009 1016 1018 1037 1046 1147 1158	264.94 259.18 258.34 256.01 249.75 249.25 248.51 247.77 246.06 245.58 245.90 243.79 239.76 237.48	235,000.00 240,000.00 240,000.00 245,000.00 245,000.00 250,000.00 250,000.00 250,000.00 250,000.00 255,000.00 255,000.00 275,000.00 275,000.00
	2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 4	887 926 929 957 981 1003 1006 1009 1016 1018 1037 1046 1147 1158 1470	264.94 259.18 258.34 256.01 249.75 249.25 248.51 247.77 246.06 245.58 245.90 243.79 239.76 237.48 255.10	235,000.00 240,000.00 240,000.00 245,000.00 245,000.00 250,000.00 250,000.00 250,000.00 250,000.00 255,000.00 275,000.00 275,000.00 375,000.00
	2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 4 4	887 926 929 957 981 1003 1006 1009 1016 1018 1037 1046 1147 1158 1470 1516	264.94 259.18 258.34 256.01 249.75 249.25 248.51 247.77 246.06 245.58 245.90 243.79 239.76 237.48 255.10 250.66	235,000.00 240,000.00 240,000.00 245,000.00 245,000.00 250,000.00 250,000.00 250,000.00 250,000.00 255,000.00 275,000.00 275,000.00 275,000.00 375,000.00 380,000.00

		54799	267.78	14,674,000.00
	4	1854	221.14	410,000.00
	4	1838	223.07	410,000.00
_	4	1813	226.14	410,000.00
	4	1774	231.12	410,000.00
	4	1711	233.78	400,000.00

- 5.10 The above is based upon all units being open market sales.
- 5.11 The average sales revenue per ft² is £297.45 for new build apartments, £293.04 for new build housing and £267.78 for refurbished units. The reduction in value for sq ft for the refurbished units can be attributed to them being over-sized in nature. Unit types are subject to a price ceiling.
- 5.12 We have researched the latest market trends for Fishponds to consider whether the prices above are realistic. The following information is taken from http://www.zoopla.co.uk/market/fishponds/?q=fishponds%2C%20Bristol
- 5.13 The table below shows average current values for properties in Fishponds:

Property value data/graphs for Fishponds

Property type	Avg. current value	Avg. £ per sq ft.	Avg. # beds	Avg. £ paid (last 12m)
Detached	£317,508	£260	3.4	£265,063
Semi-detached	£233,917	£241	3.2	£227,216
Terraced	£225,844	£230	2.9	£223,385
Flats	£149,998	£269	1.6	£132,880

It can be seen that our predicated values lie above comparables trends in the local area. The most comparable new build scheme is Barratt Homes' St Matthias development; however no sold prices have been recorded at present. We believe that our net prices are in line with asking prices for the Barratt scheme.

Affordable revenue

5.15 The applicant is not in receipt of an offer from an RSL. We have adopted a rate of £135 per sq ft, regardless of tenure, in line with transfer values that we are seeing for the outskirts of Bristol at present. This is evidenced by a recent transaction that we have been involved in at Charlton Hayes.

Ground rents

5.16 We have assumed that all new build apartments and converted buildings will be sold on a leasehold basis. We have attributed a ground rent of £250 per annum to 162 units, capitalised at 5%.

Commercial revenue

5.17 We have staggered the letting of commercial units at 6 monthly intervals to reflect the potential take-up of accommodation. We are aware that commercial units on Fishponds Road let at between £5 and £20 per sq ft depending on use class and size. The subject site is removed from the high street but will feature modern accommodation; we have therefore assumed that the majority of users will be as offices and have adopted a rent at the lower end of the scale; £10 per sq ft. It is assumed that these units will be sold as investments, at a yield of 8%.

Costs

- 5.18 We have applied BCIS costs for the base build/conversion of the proposed scheme. We have adopted median costs, re-based to Bristol, for the new build houses and apartments. We have applied an upper quartile cost for the conversion of existing Grade II listed buildings to allow for the specialist trades and materials that will be required.
- 5.19 A 5% contingency has been allowed given the presence of listed buildings and risk involved in developing a brown field site.
- 5.20 The applicant has not prepared a detailed order of costs for the development of the site. We have therefore had to adopt what in our view might be a conservative allowance of 15% of base build cost for the delivery of external works, infrastructure and services.
- 5.21 Demolition, asbestos removal and remediation costs have been provided by the applicant. Although a detailed breakdown is not available they have used their experience to apply a rate per square metre of £30 for site clearance including remediation (total £1,301,100) on top of which they have allowed £920,000 for demolition and works to the existing buildings.
- 5.22 A total of 59 no. garages are proposed as part of the development. These are not included within BCIS costings. We have used our development experience to price these at £6,500 each, totalling £383,500.

Planning obligations

- 5.23 Community Infrastructure Levy applies and is charged at £50 per sq m (£4.65 per sq ft) for residential floorspace (GIA). There is no relief application for the existing floor area as it has not been in lawful use for 6 months out of the last 3 years. Relief is available for affordable housing.
- 5.24 No Heads of Terms for a Section 106 agreement have been made available. We have assumed a contribution of £250,000.

Professional fees

5.25 Professional fees have been allowed at 7% of base build costs in line with normal market parameters.

Disposal costs

- 5.26 We have assumed that the developer will require a range of show homes to be staffed by onsite sales representatives throughout the sales period. Therefore we have allowed a cost of 3% of gross development value for site marketing, agent's fees and legal costs.
- 5.27 A fee of 1% has been allowed in respect of the sale of the affordable stock and associated legal fees.
- 5.28 Marketing costs of £25,000 have been allowed in respect of the commercial units.
- 5.29 Fees of 1.5% are payable in respect of legals and agents for the commercial investment sale.

Finance

- 5.30 A finance rate of 6.5% inclusive of entry and exit fees has been assumed in line with our current market experience.
- 5.31 Profit
- 5.32 Our recent experience of the current market is that developers and house builders are usually seeking returns of between 20 25% on GDV, and in some cases in excess of this. Profit on affordable units is usually around 6%
- 5.33 We have assumed a profit on open market housing of 20% on gross development value, and a profit on affordable units at 6% of GDV.
- 5.34 Blending the profit rates for the open market and affordable units at 20% and 6% on GDV, the 30% affordable housing baseline appraisal would require a blended profit rate of 17.7% profit on GDV.

5.35 The variant appraisal will require an increasing profit target as the amount of private housing (to which a 20% on GDV profit is required) increases.

Land value

- 5.36 After all of the above inputs are applied, the resulting land value is negative.
- 5.37 Viability guidance makes clear that the residual value must be above (or at) the threshold land value in the local area for the site to be considered viable. If the residual value generated is below this level, and all assumptions used are within market tolerances, then a reduction in statutory contributions can be made to increase site value. A willing seller will not dispose of a site below market value.
- 5.38 We firmly believe that our inputs are within market tolerances, with our revenue assumptions being in line with the market tone of the local area.
- 5.39 It can therefore be concluded that the agreed level of affordable housing makes the scheme unviable. A willing seller of a site with an allocation for residential led mixed use development in a suburb of Bristol would not accept an offer at the level shown.
- 5.40 It is therefore necessary to test differing levels of affordable housing in order to assess at what level the site reaches a threshold land value at which a willing land owner would dispose of the site.
- 5.41 It is essential that the threshold land value for a site of a similar size and type to be set. This is the value that a willing seller would be prepared to accept for the property and is based on comparable evidence from the local market.
- We have previously agreed with the District Valuer Service that the threshold land value for residential development sites with planning permission in the Bristol area lies in the region of £1,000,000 per net developable acre depending on location and market context.
- 5.43 This is backed up by the following transactional evidence:

Site	Size (NDA)	Transacted date	Price	Price per NDA
UWE St Matthias,	11.2	June 2015	£11,509,347	£1,027,620
Fishponds, Bristol				
Plots 13/14 Lyde	5.91	2014	£8,000,000	£1,350,000
	3.71	2014	10,000,000	11,000,000
Green, Emersons				
Green, S Glos				

Frenchay Hospital,	28	Summer 2015	£30,000,000	£1,034,482
Bristol		exchange of		
		contracts		
Serviced plot,	7.34	December 2015	£10,800,000	£1,471,389
Charlton Hayes				

Commentary

- 5.44 The above site sales show that the general tone of the residential land market in the Bristol area is over £1,000,000 per net developable acre. The most relevant example above is the St Matthias sale as it was at a policy level of affordable housing and the developer paid both CIL and S106 contributions. It is also approximately ½ a mile from the subject site. The price listed above is gross of abnormal costs that were deducted from the final purchase price and it therefore represents a policy compliant transaction.
- 5.45 Of the other comparables listed; the Frenchay hospital sale is yet to complete. The site has significant abnormal costs that are to be deducted, and a below policy affordable housing provision. The site sales at Lyde Green and Charlton Hayes are of 'super-serviced' sites that benefit from a below policy compliant level of affordable housing.
- 5.46 The proposed scheme at the subject site comprises both apartments and housing. We would normally expect land value for sites where apartments are to be delivered to be higher than a housing site; however in this case the cost of developing listed buildings may result in that affect being dulled.
- 5.47 We are of the opinion that the threshold value for the Bristol area is £1,000,000 per net developable acre.

Variant appraisal

- 5.48 Given the substantial deficit created by the above appraisal we have run a second one, this time with no affordable housing, in order to attempt to reach a viable position.
- 5.49 We have replaced affordable floor area with open market units, but have made no other changes to inputs aside increasing target profit to 20%
- 5.50 The resulting land value is positive, at £5,074,680 (c. £325,000 per net developable acre), but below our view on threshold land value. We believe that this is due to the cost of developing a dense mixed use scheme, the inefficiency of the conversion of listed buildings and provision of some commercial space.

6. Conclusion

- 6.1 The assumptions applied to our appraisals are based upon accurate comparable evidence, industry established build costs and development costs from the applicant's in house commercial team.
- 6.2 The established threshold land value for the greater Bristol area is in the region of £1,000,000 per net developable area.
- 6.3 The affordable housing required by policy results in a negative land value that falls well short of this target and therefore has a significant impact upon viability and deliverability.
- Our appraisals appended to this report demonstrate that the threshold land value cannot be achieved, even when no affordable housing is required. This can be attributed to the cost of developing the proposed scheme, its necessary inefficiencies and provision of commercial uses. If the site was cleared and only housing delivered we believe that a policy compliant scheme like that of St Matthias could be delivered.





Appendix I BCIS costings



Welcome back Bilfinger GVA (g1803)

Search

Your account

Help ▼

Log out

Average prices

Results

> Rebased to Bristol (102; sample 54) Edit

£/m2 study

Description: Rate per m2 gross internal floor area for the building Cost including prelims.

Last updated: 15-Oct-2016 12:20

Maximum age of results: Default period V

Building function			£/m² gross i	nternal floor a	area		Sample
(Maximum age of projects)	Mean	Lowest	Lower quartiles	Median	Upper quartiles	Highest	Jampie
lew build							
Offices							
Generally (15)	1,552	654	1,111	1,427	1,755	4,883	154
Air-conditioned							
Generally (15)	1,639	654	1,251	1,539	1,730	4,883	45
1-2 storey (15)	1,376	654	1,105	1,280	1,554	2,959	17
3-5 storey (15)	1,698	1,057	1,306	1,533	1,710	4,883	20
6+ storey (15)	2,005	1,477	1,659	1,753	1,887	3,712	7
Not air-conditioned							
Generally (15)	1,528	737	1,078	1,410	1,824	2,906	72
1-2 storey (15)	1,453	737	1,033	1,358	1,796	2,670	38
3-5 storey (15)	1,561	868	1,212	1,410	1,754	2,906	30
6+ storey (15)	1,984	1,563	-	2,021	-	2,329	4
Shops							
Generally (30)	1,128	506	689	916	1,459	3,586	52
1-2 storey (30)	1,152	506	677	926	1,499	3,586	47
3-5 storey (30)	898	750	752	887	991	1,113	5
Housing, mixed developments (15)	1,110	538	954	1,086	1,233	2,422	1080
Estate housing							
Generally (15)	1,082	536	925	1,054	1,190	3,499	1837
Single storey (15)	1,202	624	1,038	1,171	1,354	2,046	311
2-storey (15)	1,054	536	914	1,030	1,160	2,121	1390
3-storey (15)	1,071	693	883	1,015	1,201	2,233	134
4-storey or above (25)	2,000	1,152	-	1,675		3,499	4
Estate housing detached (15)	1,192	824	988	1,228	1,282	1,854	17
Estate housing semi detached							
Generally (15)	1,087	552	934	1,058	1,199	2,046	427
Single storey (15)	1,259	759	1,079	1,258	1,407	2,046	77
2-storey (15)	1,052	552	924	1,030	1,157	1,851	331
3-storey (15)	1,006	744	838	988	1,081	1,600	19
Estate housing terraced							
Generally (15)	1,099	536	918	1,061	1,221	3,499	400
Single storey (15)	1,178	706	973	1,110	1,389	1,782	54
2-storey (15)	1,081	536	916	1,050	1,196	2,121	287
3-storey (15)	1,074	698	883	1,010	1,147	2,233	58
4-storey or above (5)	3,499	-	-	-	-	-	1
Flats (apartments)							
Generally (15)	1,295	621	1,086	1,238	1,460	4,452	882
1-2 storey (15)	1,225	719	1,057	1,188	1,351	2,325	210

Building function	£/m² gross internal floor area						Sample
(Maximum age of projects)	Mean	Lowest	Lower quartiles	Median	Upper quartiles	Highest	Sample
3-5 storey (15)	1,272	621	1,073	1,232	1,449	2,538	591
6+ storey (15)	1,661	959	1,349	1,594	1,822	4,452	77
Rehabilitation/Conversion							
Offices							
Generally (15)	934	65	411	797	1,154	4,189	111
Air-conditioned							
Generally (15)	1,113	271	488	970	1,270	4,189	31
1-2 storey (15)	1,328	271	462	1,149	1,584	4,189	12
3-5 storey (15)	1,068	280	460	797	1,207	3,371	11
6+ storey (15)	860	469	763	780	1,006	1,281	5
Not air-conditioned							
Generally (15)	1,016	72	473	910	1,191	2,779	40
1-2 storey (15)	1,020	223	652	889	1,127	2,399	18
3-5 storey (15)	1,045	344	467	965	1,233	2,779	15
6+ storey (20)	771	260	372	431	1,187	1,604	5
Shops (15)	1,277	226	354	1,452	1,467	2,884	5
Housing, mixed developments (15)	996	291	716	849	1,379	1,807	10
Estate housing (20)	698	153	364	534	786	3,262	45
Estate housing detached (25)	259	226	-	-	-	291	2
Estate housing semi detached (20)	866	368	533	606	992	2,032	8
Estate housing terraced (15)	631	407	521	653	699	913	7
Flats (apartments)							
Generally (15)	1,437	395	834	1,117	1,586	4,754	65
1-2 storey (15)	1,565	458	954	1,239	1,597	4,754	21
3-5 storey (15)	1,234	395	834	1,077	1,286	4,402	29
6+ storey (15)	1,716	454	765	1,536	2,529	3,944	14

PREVIOUS

Define - 1. Basic parameters

NEXT Download

Address:

BCIS
Parliament Square
London
SW1P 3AD

Contact:

Telephone: +44 (0)20 7695 1500 Email: support@bcis.co.uk Fax: +44 (0)20 7695 1501 RICS

© 2016 RICS. All Rights Reserved.





Appendix II Appraisal baseline APPRAISAL SUMMARY BILFINGER GVA

Blackberry Hill Hospital Linden Homes and Galliford Try

Summary Appraisal for Phase 1

Currency in £

REVENUE						
Sales Valuation	Units	ft²	Rate ft ²	Unit Price	Gross Sales	
Block A	13	8,071	135.00	83,814	1,089,585	
Block B	13	7,767	135.00	80,657	1,048,545	
Block C	5	3,448	135.00	93,096	465,480	
Block D	8	5,638	135.00	95,141	761,130	
Block E	8	5,638	135.00	95,141	761,130	
Block F	78	58,269	267.78	200,042	15,603,273	
Zone G	19	19,095	293.04	294,505	5,595,599	
Block H	18	11,935	267.78	177,553	3,195,954	
Block J	17	22,051	267.78	347,342	5,904,817	
Zone K	12	10,949	293.04	267,375	3,208,495	
Zone L	10	9,739	135.00	131,477	1,314,765	
Zone M	20	28,573	135.00	192,868	3,857,355	
Zone N	13	14,574	293.04	328,520	4,270,765	
Zone P	29	33,190	293.04	335,379	9,725,998	
Zone Q	14	14,149	135.00	136,437	1,910,115	
Zone R	13	14,128	293.04	318,467	4,140,069	
Zone S	15	15,757	293.04	307,829	4,617,431	
Ground rent 162 units @ £250 pa 5%	<u>1</u>	<u>0</u>	0.00	810,000	<u>810,000</u>	
Totals	306	282,971			68,280,506	
Rental Area Summary				Initial	Net Rent	Initial
-	Units	ft²	Rate ft ²	MRV/Unit	at Sale	MRV
Commercial unit 1	1	548	10.00	5,480	5,480	5,480
Commercial unit 2	1	540	10.00	5,400	5,400	5,400
Commercial unit 3	1	637	10.00	6,370	6,370	6,370
Commercial unit 4	1	1,102	10.00	11,020	11,020	11,020
Commercial unit 5	1	548	10.00	5,480	5,480	5,480
Commercial unit 6	1	540	10.00	5,400	5,400	5,400
Commercial unit 7	1	637	10.00	6,370	6,370	6,370
Commercial unit 8	1	1,102	10.00	11,020	11,020	11,020

APPRAISAL SUMMARY						
Blackberry Hill Hospital						
Linden Homes and Galliford Try						
Community space	<u>1</u>	<u>3,014</u>		0	<u>0</u>	
Totals	9	8,668			56,540	56,540
Investment Valuation						
Commercial unit 1						
Market Rent	5,480	YP @	8.0000%	12.5000		
		PV 3yrs 6mths @	8.0000%	0.7639	52,325	
Commercial unit 2		\ / 5_0	/			
Market Rent	5,400	YP @	8.0000%	12.5000	50 570	
On many amplied could be		PV 3yrs 9mths @	8.0000%	0.7493	50,578	
Commercial unit 3 Market Rent	6,370	YP @	8.0000%	12.5000		
Market Rent	6,370	PV 4yrs @	8.0000%	0.7350	58,527	
Commercial unit 4		1 V 4y13 @	0.000078	0.7330	30,321	
Market Rent	11,020	YP @	8.0000%	12.5000		
	,020	PV 4yrs 3mths @	8.0000%	0.7210	99,321	
Commercial unit 5					,	
Market Rent	5,480	YP @	8.0000%	12.5000		
		PV 4yrs 6mths @	8.0000%	0.7073	48,449	
Commercial unit 6						
Market Rent	5,400	YP @	8.0000%	12.5000		
		PV 4yrs 9mths @	8.0000%	0.6938	46,832	
Commercial unit 7		\ / 5_0	/			
Market Rent	6,370	YP @	8.0000%	12.5000	54.404	
Commonsial unit 0		PV 5yrs @	8.0000%	0.6806	54,191	
Commercial unit 8 Market Rent	11.020	YP @	8.0000%	12.5000		
Market Rent	11,020	PV 5yrs 3mths @	8.0000%	0.6676	91,964	
		i v byla billila 🖷	0.000070	0.0070	502,187	
					302,101	
GROSS DEVELOPMENT VALUE				68,782,692		
D 1 0 1		= 000 <i>1</i>	(00 107)			
Purchaser's Costs		5.80%	(29,127)	(29,127)		
				(23,121)		
NET DEVELOPMENT VALUE				68,753,565		

BILFINGER GVA

APPRAISAL SUMMARY BILFINGER GVA

Blackberry Hill Hospital Linden Homes and Galliford Try NET REALISATION

68,753,565

OUTLAY

ACQUISITION COSTS

Residualised Price (Negative land) (1,615,326)

(1,615,326)

CONSTRUCTION COSTS

Construction	ft²	Rate ft ²	Cost	
Commercial unit 1	548 ft ²	85.00 pf ²	46,580	
Commercial unit 2	540 ft ²	85.00 pf ²	45,900	
Commercial unit 3	637 ft ²	85.00 pf ²	54,145	
Commercial unit 4	1,102 ft ²	85.00 pf ²	93,670	
Commercial unit 5	548 ft ²	85.00 pf ²	46,580	
Commercial unit 6	540 ft ²	85.00 pf ²	45,900	
Commercial unit 7	637 ft ²	85.00 pf ²	54,145	
Commercial unit 8	1,102 ft ²	85.00 pf ²	93,670	
Community space	3,014 ft ²	85.00 pf ²	256,190	
Block A	11,508 ft ²	114.45 pf ²	1,317,091	
Block B	11,205 ft ²	114.45 pf ²	1,282,412	
Block C	5,813 ft ²	114.45 pf ²	665,298	
Block D	7,556 ft ²	114.45 pf ²	864,784	
Block E	7,556 ft ²	114.45 pf ²	864,784	
Block F	83,474 ft ²	147.34 pf ²	12,299,059	
Zone G	19,095 ft ²	97.91 pf ²	1,869,591	
Block H	13,950 ft ²	147.34 pf ²	2,055,393	
Block J	24,563 ft ²	147.34 pf ²	3,619,112	
Zone K	10,949 ft ²	97.91 pf ²	1,072,017	
Zone L	9,739 ft ²	97.91 pf ²	953,545	
Zone M	28,573 ft ²	97.91 pf ²	2,797,582	
Zone N	14,574 ft ²	97.91 pf ²	1,426,940	
Zone P	33,190 ft ²	97.91 pf ²	3,249,633	
Zone Q	14,149 ft ²	97.91 pf ²	1,385,329	
Zone R	14,128 ft ²	97.91 pf ²	1,383,272	
Zone S	15,757 ft ²	97.91 pf ²	1,542,768	
Totals	334,447 ft ²		39,385,392	39,385,392

APPRAISAL SUMMARY						BILFINGER GVA
Blackberry Hill Hospital						
Linden Homes and Galliford Try						
Contingency		5.00%	1,969,270			
Demolition			2,222,572			
CIL	229,680 ft ²	4.65 pf ²	1,068,012			
S106			250,000			
				5,509,854		
Other Construction						
Externals		5.00%	1,932,431			
Infrastructure		5.00%	1,932,431			
Services		5.00%	1,932,431			
Garages - 59 no. @ £6,500 each			383,500			
				6,180,792		
PROFESSIONAL FEES						
Professional fees		7.00%	2,892,248			
				2,892,248		
MARKETING & LETTING						
Commercial marketing costs			25,000			
				25,000		
DISPOSAL FEES						
Sales Agent Fee		3.00%	1,712,172			
Affordable transfer fee		1.00%	112,081			
Commercial investment sale fee		1.50%	7,533			
				1,831,786		
FINANCE						
Debit Rate 6.500%, Credit Rate 0.000	0% (Nominal)					
Total Finance Cost				2,369,284		
TOTAL COSTS				56,579,029		
PROFIT						
				12,174,537		
Performance Measures						
Profit on Cost%		21.52%				
Profit on GDV%		17.70%				
Profit on NDV%		17.71%				
Development Yield% (on Rent)		0.10%				
= = : : : >p		0				

APPRAISAL SUMMARY BILFINGER GVA

Blackberry Hill Hospital Linden Homes and Galliford Try

Equivalent Yield% (Nominal) 8.00% Equivalent Yield% (True) 8.42%

IRR 24.64%

Rent Cover 215 yrs 4 mths Profit Erosion (finance rate 6.500%) 3 yrs





Appendix III Appraisal - nil affordable APPRAISAL SUMMARY BILFINGER GVA

Blackberry Hill Hospital Linden Homes and Galliford Try

Summary Appraisal for Phase 1

Currency in £

REVENUE

KEVEROE						
Sales Valuation	Units	ft²	Rate ft ²	Unit Price	Gross Sales	
Block A	13	8,071	297.45	184,671	2,400,719	
Block B	13	7,767	297.45	177,715	2,310,294	
Block C	5	3,448	297.45	205,122	1,025,608	
Block D	8	5,638	297.45	209,628	1,677,023	
Block E	8	5,638	297.45	209,628	1,677,023	
Block F	78	58,269	267.78	200,042	15,603,273	
Zone G	19	19,095	293.04	294,505	5,595,599	
Block H	18	11,935	267.78	177,553	3,195,954	
Block J	17	22,051	267.78	347,342	5,904,817	
Zone K	12	10,949	293.04	267,375	3,208,495	
Zone L	10	9,739	293.04	285,392	2,853,917	
Zone M	20	28,573	293.04	418,652	8,373,032	
Zone N	13	14,574	293.04	328,520	4,270,765	
Zone P	29	33,190	293.04	335,379	9,725,998	
Zone Q	14	14,149	293.04	296,159	4,146,223	
Zone R	13	14,128	293.04	318,467	4,140,069	
Zone S	15	15,757	293.04	307,829	4,617,431	
Ground rent 162 units @ £250 pa 5%	<u>1</u>	<u>0</u>	0.00	810,000	810,000	
Totals	306	282,971			81,536,239	
Rental Area Summary				Initial	Net Rent	Initial
	Units	ft²	Rate ft ²	MRV/Unit	at Sale	MRV
Commercial unit 1	1	548	10.00	5,480	5,480	5,480
Commercial unit 2	1	540	10.00	5,400	5,400	5,400
Commercial unit 3	1	637	10.00	6,370	6,370	6,370
Commercial unit 4	1	1,102	10.00	11,020	11,020	11,020
Commercial unit 5	1	548	10.00	5,480	5,480	5,480
Commercial unit 6	1	540	10.00	5,400	5,400	5,400
Commercial unit 7	1	637	10.00	6,370	6,370	6,370
Commercial unit 8	1	1,102	10.00	11,020	11,020	11,020

File: \\gvaapp01\D\Winapps\ArgusDev\ProgramData\Data\James Petherick\Blackberry Hill\Appraisal - BBH.wcfx ARGUS Developer Version: 6.50.002

APPRAISAL SUMMARY						
Blackberry Hill Hospital Linden Homes and Galliford Try						
Community space Totals	<u>1</u>	3,014 8,668		0	<u>0</u> 56,540	56,540
Investment Valuation Commercial unit 1						
Market Rent	5,480	YP @ PV 3yrs 6mths @	8.0000% 8.0000%	12.5000 0.7639	52,325	
Commercial unit 2						
Market Rent	5,400	YP @ PV 3yrs 9mths @	8.0000% 8.0000%	12.5000 0.7493	50,578	
Commercial unit 3						
Market Rent	6,370	YP @ PV 4yrs @	8.0000% 8.0000%	12.5000 0.7350	58,527	
Commercial unit 4						
Market Rent	11,020	YP @ PV 4yrs 3mths @	8.0000% 8.0000%	12.5000 0.7210	99,321	
Commercial unit 5		•			•	
Market Rent	5,480	YP @ PV 4yrs 6mths @	8.0000% 8.0000%	12.5000 0.7073	48,449	
Commercial unit 6		•				
Market Rent	5,400	YP @ PV 4yrs 9mths @	8.0000% 8.0000%	12.5000 0.6938	46,832	
Commercial unit 7		•			•	
Market Rent	6,370	YP @ PV 5yrs @	8.0000% 8.0000%	12.5000 0.6806	54,191	
Commercial unit 8		.,			- , -	
Market Rent	11,020	YP @ PV 5yrs 3mths @	8.0000% 8.0000%	12.5000 0.6676	91,964 502,187	
GROSS DEVELOPMENT VALUE				82,038,426		
Purchaser's Costs		5.80%	(29,127)	(29,127)		
NET DEVELOPMENT VALUE				82,009,299		

BILFINGER GVA

APPRAISAL SUMMARY BILFINGER GVA

Blackberry Hill Hospital Linden Homes and Galliford Try NET REALISATION

82,009,299

319,354

OUTLAY

ACQUISITION COSTS			
Residualised Price (15.66 Acres 324,053.63 pAcre)		5,074,680	
			5,074,680
Stamp Duty		243,234	
Agent Fee	1.00%	50,747	
Legal Fee	0.50%	25,373	

CONSTRUCTION COSTS

Construction	ft²	Rate ft ²	Cost	
Commercial unit 1	548 ft ²	85.00 pf ²	46,580	
Commercial unit 2	540 ft ²	85.00 pf ²	45,900	
Commercial unit 3	637 ft ²	85.00 pf ²	54,145	
Commercial unit 4	1,102 ft ²	85.00 pf ²	93,670	
Commercial unit 5	548 ft ²	85.00 pf ²	46,580	
Commercial unit 6	540 ft ²	85.00 pf ²	45,900	
Commercial unit 7	637 ft ²	85.00 pf ²	54,145	
Commercial unit 8	1,102 ft ²	85.00 pf ²	93,670	
Community space	3,014 ft ²	85.00 pf ²	256,190	
Block A	11,508 ft ²	114.45 pf ²	1,317,091	
Block B	11,205 ft ²	114.45 pf ²	1,282,412	
Block C	5,813 ft ²	114.45 pf ²	665,298	
Block D	7,556 ft ²	114.45 pf ²	864,784	
Block E	7,556 ft ²	114.45 pf ²	864,784	
Block F	83,474 ft ²	147.34 pf ²	12,299,059	
Zone G	19,095 ft ²	97.91 pf ²	1,869,591	
Block H	13,950 ft ²	147.34 pf ²	2,055,393	
Block J	24,563 ft ²	147.34 pf ²	3,619,112	
Zone K	10,949 ft ²	97.91 pf ²	1,072,017	
Zone L	9,739 ft ²	97.91 pf ²	953,545	
Zone M	28,573 ft ²	97.91 pf ²	2,797,582	
Zone N	14,574 ft ²	97.91 pf ²	1,426,940	
Zone P	33,190 ft ²	97.91 pf ²	3,249,633	
Zone Q	14,149 ft ²	97.91 pf ²	1,385,329	

File: \\gvaapp01\D\\Winapps\ArgusDev\\ProgramData\Data\James Petherick\Blackberry Hill\Appraisal - BBH.wcfx ARGUS Developer Version: 6.50.002

APPRAISAL SUMMARY				
Blackberry Hill Hospital				
Linden Homes and Galliford Try				
Zone R	14,128 ft ²	97.91 pf ²	1,383,272	
Zone S	15,757 ft ²	97.91 pf ²	1,542,768	
Totals	334,447 ft ²		39,385,392	39,385,392
Contingency		5.00%	1,969,270	
Demolition			2,222,572	
CIL	325,779 ft ²	4.65 pf ²	1,514,872	
S106			250,000	
Other Construction				5,956,714
Externals		5.00%	1,932,431	
Infrastructure		5.00%	1,932,431	
Services		5.00%	1,932,431	
Garages - 59 no. @ £6,500 each			383,500	
			·	6,180,792
PROFESSIONAL FEES				
Professional fees		7.00%	2,892,248	
MARKETING & LETTING				2,892,248
Commercial marketing costs			25,000	
G			,	25,000
DISPOSAL FEES				
Sales Agent Fee		3.00%	2,421,787	
Commercial investment sale		1.50%	7,533	
				2,429,320
FINANCE				
Debit Rate 6.500%, Credit Rate 0.000% (Nominal)				0.000.44=
Total Finance Cost				3,338,115
TOTAL COSTS				65,601,614
PROFIT				
				16,407,685
Performance Measures				

25.01%

File: \\gvaapp01\D\Winapps\ArgusDev\ProgramData\Data\James Petherick\Blackberry Hill\Appraisal - BBH.wcfx ARGUS Developer Version: 6.50.002

Profit on Cost%

BILFINGER GVA

APPRAISAL SUMMARY BILFINGER GVA

Blackberry Hill Hospital Linden Homes and Galliford Try

Profit on GDV%	20.00%
Profit on NDV%	20.01%
Development Yield% (on Rent)	0.09%
Equivalent Yield% (Nominal)	8.00%
Equivalent Yield% (True)	8.42%

IRR 23.91%

Rent Cover 290 yrs 2 mths Profit Erosion (finance rate 6.500%) 3 yrs 6 mths